Building Electrification Talking Points

Last updated 03/20/23

San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility (SF Bay PSR) represents hundreds of health professionals, who seek to protect the health of our patients and communities who are threatened by the climate emergency that is destroying our life support system. SF Bay PSR seeks to rapidly advance policies and regulations in support of an equitable transition to all electric buildings. Switching from fossil-fuel appliances to all electric appliances will help protect health and the planet.

We developed these talking points to facilitate health professionals’ advocacy via public comments, testimony, media interviews, and public presentations for California state-wide policies, as well as county and city ordinances and building “reach codes.” The talking points are based on key summary points from these resources, which provide extensive supplemental information in developing comments. A boilerplate sample testimony is at the end of this document. Comments are often limited to 1-3 minutes in many forums, so what is important for us to guarantee is that the health voice is brought to bear on the issue in support of community-based advocates.

Key talking points:

1. Building electrification is a key strategy for addressing our climate emergency.
2. Building electrification prevents toxic exposures to air pollution from gas stoves and other gas appliances.
4. State, local, and other policymakers should undertake building electrification rapidly and equitably.

1. Building electrification is a key strategy for addressing our climate emergency.

- The United Nation’s IPCC climate change report warned that “rapid and deep” cuts to greenhouse gas emissions (GHG) are needed to stay below the targeted 1.5 degrees Celsius of global warming. Without strengthening climate policies, greenhouse gas emissions are projected to lead to a median global warming of about 3.2 degrees Celsius by 2100.
- “Greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from California’s building sector account for more than a quarter of the state’s total emissions. Direct emissions from building fossil fuel use account for 10–15% of the total. These emissions result primarily from both the combustion of gas in buildings for cooking, heating, and water heating as well as from methane leaks throughout the gas distribution system.” (UCLA 2019 page 3).
- Building electrification (BE), defined as “replacing gas with efficient electric appliances in existing buildings and constructing new building as all-electric” is the primary approach to building decarbonization.

2. Building electrification prevents toxic exposures to air pollution from gas stoves and other gas appliances, among other health benefits.

- California has the highest percentage of gas stove use in the country. 88% of all CA households (11.5 million in total) had natural gas service in 2020; typically 70% of these households cook with a natural gas stove or oven.*

www.sfbaypsr.org
Natural gas throughout California contains numerous hazardous air pollutants that are linked to cancer, asthma, and the formation of smog. Recent research that tested natural gas in 159 homes in California found that hazardous air pollutants are ubiquitous in natural gas supplied to California homes. Benzene, a known human carcinogen, was found in virtually every sample.

Scientists documented that even when gas stoves are off, they can leak benzene in concentrations such that indoor air concentrations are on a par with secondhand smoke. The study underestimates the true quantity of natural gas emissions as it does not include potential leaks from other gas appliances and emissions of natural gas when the stove/oven is on.

Researchers calculated that “California’s gas appliances and distribution-level infrastructure leak the same amount of benzene as the emissions from nearly 60,000 cars each year.”

In the San Francisco Bay Area, gas furnaces and water heaters contribute more nitrogen oxides (NOx) air pollution than the region’s passenger cars. (BAAQMD staff report, page 4).

Given the scale of leaks and emissions throughout the state, natural gas is a significant source of air pollution that can impact air quality and public health. These emissions are not currently included in any statewide emissions inventory.

Gas stoves produce dangerous amounts of air pollutants, including nitrogen oxides (NOx), carbon monoxide (CO), and particulate matter (PM), that often exceed outdoor ambient air standards. These pollutants can have lasting and damaging effects on the human body. Children, low income, and communities of color are among the most vulnerable.

Homes with gas stoves can emit NOx concentrations that are 50-400% higher than homes with electric stoves.

A 2020 UCLA study (p.6) found that “Under a hypothetical cooking scenario where a stove and oven are used simultaneously for one hour, peak concentrations of NO2 from cooking with gas appliances exceed the levels of acute national and California-based ambient air quality thresholds in more than 90% of modeled emission scenarios.”

New research led by RMI on the correlation between gas stoves and childhood asthma found that:

Over 12% of current childhood asthma in the US can be attributed to gas stove use, which is comparable to children’s risk of being exposed to secondhand smoke. In California, over 20% of current childhood asthma cases can be attributed to gas stove use.

Children in homes with gas stoves have a 42% increased risk of experiencing asthma symptoms, a 24% increased risk of ever being diagnosed with asthma by a doctor, and an overall 32% increased risk of both current and lifetime asthma.

Chronic exposure to elevated PM2.5 has the potential to damage human respiratory systems, as well as the cardiovascular system, and may result in premature death.

A 2020 UCLA study (p.7) found: “If all residential gas appliances were immediately replaced with clean electric alternatives, the reduction of outdoor NOx and PM2.5 would result in 354 fewer deaths, as well as 596 fewer cases of acute bronchitis, and 304 fewer cases of chronic bronchitis annually in California.

The numbers above are equivalent to approximately $3.5 billion in monetized health benefits over the course of one year. But these numbers only account for exposures from outdoor air as a result of residential electrification; a full exposure assessment accounting for indoor exposures would increase the total health benefits and the associated economic benefits of residential electrification.
Cooking with induction is faster, more precise, easier to clean up, and because induction cooks with magnetic fields, it doesn’t get hot to the touch and can reduce the chance of burns or fires — making it easier to cook with children. Also, top chefs love induction cooktops.

Making the switch to electric heat pumps will ensure that families have more efficient and thus affordable in-home cooling and heating during periods of extreme weather and decrease strain on the electrical grid during peak hours. Extreme heat is one of the deadliest weather events.


- African-American and Hispanic children with asthma are likely the most disproportionately burdened by indoor air pollution from gas stoves.
- Poor people without adequate heating will often use gas stoves to heat their home which contributes to indoor air pollution.
- Low-income and communities of color are three times more likely to live in an area with poor outdoor air quality, which compounds indoor air pollution health harms. (American Lung Association)
- Inequity in exposure to air pollution from gas stoves is reinforced by housing conditions which exacerbate exposure, such as: smaller unit size, greater occupant density, old or unmaintained and often inadequate stove-top ventilation which contributes to elevated concentrations of NOx in lower-income, multifamily buildings, and the reality that renters often do not want to ask landlords to change or repair appliances for fear of a rent increase or eviction.
- 99% of disadvantaged communities in California live in an ozone nonattainment area. Transitioning homes to electric heat pumps and water heaters can tackle a key source of NOx pollution, improving air quality, and supporting the state in meeting federal air quality standards that protect health.

4. State, local, and other policymakers should undertake building electrification rapidly and equitably.

- **RECOGNIZE THAT BUILDING ELECTRIFICATION CAN BE DONE!** As of February 2023, 74 jurisdictions in California have building decarbonization ordinances in place.
- **RMI**, SF Bay Area community choice renewable energy aggregators such as Clean Power SF and Peninsula Clean Energy have confirmed that our Bay Area electrical systems and grid are ready for people to start switching to all electric.
- **UNDERTAKE BUILDING ELECTRIFICATION EQUITABLY.** Equity when designing and implementing building decarbonization policies is essential and needs to be hard-wired into policies from the beginning. Marginalized communities must be included in decision processes, not bear disproportionate costs, and should have ample opportunity to reap benefits of building electrification.
- An equitable framework for building electrification is outlined here. According to the Greenlining Institute, “Electrification can provide environmental and social justice communities access to the major benefits such as cleaner air, healthier homes, good jobs and empowered workers, and greater access to affordable clean energy and energy efficiency to reduce monthly energy bills, while helping the state meet its climate goals, including a net-zero carbon economy and 100% clean electricity by 2045.”
● Create authentic partnerships that center the perspectives of vulnerable communities, support community-based participation and power that results in shared decision-making, while also strengthening the health and well-being of the entire region.

● Governments must provide financial incentives, such as tax credits or rebates, that will enable low-income homeowners to eliminate gas appliance, particularly stove pollution, including adding plug-in induction stovetops or switching from gas to electric stoves.

● Currently, layering incentives available in the Bay Area provide significant cost savings for most home owners and will allow low-income families to install space heat and water heaters for almost no cost according to SPUR’s analysis here.

● Policies must ensure that electrification offers significant bill savings that can help energy burdened communities transition away from gas.

● Prioritize investments that close historic racialized gaps in a way that will provide healthier housing and communities, improve access to jobs, including green energy jobs, and economic and health access opportunities for underinvested communities.

● Electrifying our building stock produces a new demand for skilled workers. A 2019 UCLA study documented (p. ES-4) that building electrification in California could support an average of 64,200–104,100 jobs annually, after accounting for losses in the gas industry. The greatest increases in employment would be building retrofits and renewable energy construction, while the greatest decreases would be in gas distribution followed by labor-saving, all-electric new construction. However, the negative labor impacts are much smaller than the positive impacts.

● As described in detail in UCLA’s 2019 report, (p. Es-8) “California policy makers should aim to expand high-road opportunities that offer family-sustaining wages, benefits, and job security for workers. Because they procure services—climate and energy agencies, utilities, and local governments exert the most influence on the labor market through demand-side strategies.”

* 2022 PSE Study here. Also, see PSE press release here.
5. Boilerplate example of building electrification testimony

I’m [NAME.] I am [TYPE OF HEALTH PROFESSIONAL] and speaking to you on behalf of San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility (PSR), which represents hundreds of health professionals throughout our region, who speak for the health of our patients and communities, who are increasingly impacted by the unfolding public and environmental health impacts of global warming, and clearly connected issues of air pollution.

The recently released assessment by the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change is unequivocal in its call for urgent action to ensure an energy efficient and fossil-free future. Reducing reliance on gas appliances is health protective, not only because of the climate benefits of moving away from fossil fuel extraction and use, but also because gas stoves and other appliances can be a large source of toxic pollution in homes, reaching levels of pollution that would be illegal in outdoor settings. Children, especially those of color, are particularly at risk of respiratory illnesses, such as asthma, associated with gas appliance pollution, and lower income households may be at higher risk of exposure.

So, as one example, a 2013 meta-analysis looking at the association between gas stoves and childhood asthma found children in homes with gas stoves have a 42% increased risk of experiencing asthma symptoms (current asthma), a 24% increased risk of ever being diagnosed with asthma by a doctor (lifetime asthma), and an overall 32% increased risk of both current and lifetime asthma.

In addition, there is mounting evidence linking combustion related air pollution with adverse brain development. A 2009 study found evidence that infant through preschool-age early-life exposure (through age four) to indoor air pollution from gas appliances may be related to impaired cognitive function and may increase the risk of developing attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) symptoms.

Accordingly, we strongly support [FILL IN THE SPECIFIC ASK]. As such, you would join many other cities in California that have already adopted electric requirements for new construction in order to avoid new fossil gas use, in recognition of numerous benefits to community health, safety, and a stable climate future afforded by this transformation.

We call on you to use this critical opportunity to demonstrate your leadership and commitment to rapidly develop the more economical, pollution-free buildings we need now for the optimal public, environmental and climate health that we and future generations so deserve.

For questions, please contact info@sfbaypsr.org with the subject line, Building Electrification. Thank you to SF Bay PSR Intern Alma Hernandez for her great help compiling the online references and talking points.